

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ALABAMA  
SOUTHERN DIVISION**

Metropolitan Transportation Authority, *et al.*,

Plaintiffs,

v.

**No. 2:22-cv-00265-RDP**

Blue Cross Blue Shield of Alabama, *et al.*,

Defendants.

**JOINT STIPULATION REGARDING BRIEFING SCHEDULE**

Plaintiffs and Defendants in the above-captioned action (together, the “Parties”), by and through their undersigned counsel, hereby stipulate and agree as follows:

On January 20, 2023, all Defendants filed a motion to dismiss (Dkt. 188) and certain Defendants filed a motion to dismiss challenging personal jurisdiction and venue (Dkts. 182, 187). On January 27, 2023, the Parties filed a joint stipulation regarding a briefing schedule applicable to these motions. The Court adopted the Parties’ stipulated briefing schedule on January 30, 2023. (Dkt. 192). On February 27, 2023, the Parties filed a second joint stipulation regarding the briefing schedule applicable to these motions. (Dkt. 201). The Court adopted the Parties’ stipulated amendments to the briefing schedule on February 27, 2023 (Dkt. 202). The Parties have since further met and conferred regarding the briefing schedule applicable to these motions.

NOW, THEREFORE, the Parties agree as follows:

1. Plaintiffs’ briefs in opposition to each of the motions to dismiss filed by Defendants (Dkts. 182, 187, 188) are due by April 10, 2023.

2. Defendants' reply briefs in support of each motion to dismiss (Dkts. 182, 187, 188) are due by May 10, 2023.

Dated: March 27, 2023

Respectfully submitted,

s/ Wilson F. Green

Wilson F. Green

**OF COUNSEL:**

**WILSON F. GREEN LLC**  
301 19<sup>th</sup> Street North, Ste. 525  
Birmingham, Alabama 35203  
(205) 722-1018  
[Wilson@wilsongreenlaw.com](mailto:Wilson@wilsongreenlaw.com)

*Counsel for Plaintiffs*

Metropolitan Transportation Authority,  
Long Island Rail Road Company,  
Manhattan and Bronx Surface Transit  
Operating Authority, Metro-North  
Commuter Railroad Company, New  
York City Transit Authority, Triborough  
Bridge and Tunnel Authority, MTA Bus  
Company, MTA Construction and  
Development Company, Staten Island  
Transit Operating Authority

Regina Calcaterra  
Michael Liskow  
Anjori Mitra  
**CALCATERRA POLLACK LLP**  
1140 Avenue of the Americas, 9<sup>th</sup> Fl.  
New York, NY 10036  
Telephone: (212) 899-1760  
[rccalcaterra@calcaterrapollack.com](mailto:rccalcaterra@calcaterrapollack.com)  
[mliskow@calcaterrapollack.com](mailto:mliskow@calcaterrapollack.com)  
[amitra@calcaterrapollack.com](mailto:amitra@calcaterrapollack.com)

*Counsel for Plaintiffs*

Metropolitan Transportation Authority,  
Long Island Rail Road Company,  
Manhattan and Bronx Surface Transit

Operating Authority, Metro-North Commuter Railroad Company, New York City Transit Authority, Triborough Bridge and Tunnel Authority, MTA Bus Company, MTA Construction and Development Company, Staten Island Transit Operating Authority

Dated: March 27, 2023

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ David Korn

Evan R. Chesler  
Karin A. DeMasi  
Lauren R. Kennedy  
Helam Gebremariam  
David H. Korn  
CRAVATH, SWAINE & MOORE LLP  
Worldwide Plaza  
825 Eighth Avenue  
New York, NY 10019  
Tel: (212) 474-1000  
Fax: (212) 474-3700  
[echesler@cravath.com](mailto:echesler@cravath.com)  
[kdemasi@cravath.com](mailto:kdemasi@cravath.com)  
[lkennedy@cravath.com](mailto:lkennedy@cravath.com)  
[hgebremariam@cravath.com](mailto:hgebremariam@cravath.com)  
[dkorn@cravath.com](mailto:dkorn@cravath.com)

*Lead Counsel for the Blue Cross Blue Shield System; Counsel for Defendants Blue Cross Blue Shield Association; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Alabama; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Arizona, Inc.; GuideWell Mutual Holding Corporation; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Florida, Inc.; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Massachusetts, Inc.; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of North Carolina; BlueCross BlueShield*

*of Tennessee, Inc.; California Physicians' Service d/b/a Blue Shield of California; CareFirst, Inc.; CareFirst of Maryland, Inc.; Group Hospitalization and Medical Services, Inc.; CareFirst BlueChoice, Inc.; Hawaii Medical Service Association (Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Hawaii); Health Care Service Corporation, an Illinois Mutual Legal Reserve Company, including its divisions Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Illinois, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Texas, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of New Mexico, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Oklahoma, and Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Montana; Caring for Montanans, Inc., f/k/a Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Montana, Inc.; Wellmark of South Dakota, Inc. (Wellmark Blue Cross and Blue Shield of South Dakota); Wellmark, Inc. (Wellmark Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Iowa); Triple-S Management Corporation; Triple-S Salud, Inc.*

Craig A. Hoover  
E. Desmond Hogan  
Justin Bernick  
Elizabeth Jose  
W. David Maxwell  
HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP  
Columbia Square  
555 13th Street, N.W.  
Washington, DC 20004  
Tel: (202) 637-5600  
Fax: (202) 637-5910  
[craig.hoover@hoganlovells.com](mailto:craig.hoover@hoganlovells.com)  
[desmond.hogan@hoganlovells.com](mailto:desmond.hogan@hoganlovells.com)  
[justin.bernick@hoganlovells.com](mailto:justin.bernick@hoganlovells.com)

Kimberly R. West (Liaison Counsel)  
Mark M. Hogewood  
WALLACE, JORDAN, RATLIFF &  
BRANDT, LLC  
First Commercial Bank Building  
800 Shades Creek Parkway, Suite 400  
Birmingham, AL 35209  
Tel: (205) 870-0555  
Fax: (205) 871-7534  
[kwest@wallacejordan.com](mailto:kwest@wallacejordan.com)  
[mhogewood@wallacejordan.com](mailto:mhogewood@wallacejordan.com)

*Counsel for Defendants Blue Cross Blue Shield Association; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Arizona, Inc.; CareFirst, Inc.;*

elizabeth.jose@hoganlovells.com  
david.maxwell@hoganlovells.com

*Counsel for Anthem, Inc., f/k/a WellPoint, Inc., and all of its named subsidiaries in this action; Louisiana Health Service & Indemnity Company (Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana); BCBSM, Inc. (Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Minnesota); Blue Cross and Blue Shield of South Carolina; Horizon Healthcare Services, Inc. (Horizon Blue Cross and Blue Shield of New Jersey); Blue Cross & Blue Shield of Rhode Island; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Vermont; Cambia Health Solutions, Inc.; Regence Blue Shield of Idaho; Regence Blue Cross Blue Shield of Utah; Regence Blue Shield (of Washington); Regence Blue Cross Blue Shield of Oregon*

John D. Martin  
Lucile H. Cohen  
Travis A. Bustamante  
NELSON MULLINS RILEY &  
SCARBOROUGH LLP  
1320 Main Street, 17th Floor  
Columbia, SC 29201  
Tel: (803) 255-9421  
Fax: (803) 256-7500  
john.martin@nelsonmullins.com  
lucie.cohen@nelsonmullins.com  
travis.bustamante@nelsonmullins.com

*Counsel for Anthem, Inc., f/k/a WellPoint, Inc., and all of its named subsidiaries in this action; Louisiana Health Service & Indemnity Company (Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana); BCBSM, Inc. (Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Minnesota); Blue Cross and Blue Shield of South Carolina; Horizon Healthcare Services, Inc. (Horizon Blue Cross and Blue Shield of New Jersey); Blue Cross & Blue Shield of Rhode*

*CareFirst of Maryland, Inc.; Group Hospitalization and Medical Services, Inc.; Health Care Service Corporation, an Illinois Mutual Legal Reserve Company, including its divisions Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Illinois, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Texas, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of New Mexico, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Oklahoma, and Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Montana; Caring for Montanans, Inc., f/k/a Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Montana, Inc.; Highmark Health; Highmark Inc., f/k/a Highmark Health Services; Highmark West Virginia Inc.; Highmark BCBSD Inc.; California Physicians' Service d/b/a Blue Shield of California; Wellmark of South Dakota, Inc. (Wellmark Blue Cross and Blue Shield of South Dakota); Wellmark, Inc. (Wellmark Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Iowa); Hawaii Medical Service Association (Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Hawaii)*

Carl S. Burkhalter  
John Thomas A. Malatesta, III  
MAYNARD COOPER & GALE PC  
1901 6th Avenue North, Suite 2400  
Regions Harbert Plaza  
Birmingham, AL 35203  
Tel: (205) 254-1000  
Fax: (205) 254-1999  
cburkhalter@marnardcooper.com  
jmalatesta@marnardcooper.com

Pamela B. Slate  
HILL CARTER FRANCO COLE &  
BLACK, P.C.  
425 South Perry Street

*Island; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Vermont; Cambia Health Solutions, Inc.; Regence Blue Shield of Idaho; Regence Blue Cross Blue Shield of Utah; Regence Blue Shield (of Washington); Regence Blue Cross Blue Shield of Oregon; Blue Cross & Blue Shield of Mississippi, a Mutual Insurance Company; Wellmark of South Dakota, Inc. (Wellmark Blue Cross and Blue Shield of South Dakota); Wellmark, Inc. (Wellmark Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Iowa); Hawaii Medical Service Association (Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Hawaii); Triple-S Salud, Inc; Defendants Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Florida, Inc.; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Massachusetts, Inc.; BlueCross BlueShield of Tennessee, Inc.*

Cavender C. Kimble  
BALCH & BINGHAM LLP  
1901 6th Avenue North, Suite 1500  
Birmingham, AL 35203-4642  
Tel: (205) 226-3437  
Fax: (205) 488-5860  
ckimble@balch.com

*Counsel for Anthem, Inc., f/k/a WellPoint, Inc., and all of its named subsidiaries in this action; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of North Carolina; Louisiana Health Service & Indemnity Company (Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Louisiana); BCBSM, Inc. (Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Minnesota); Blue Cross and Blue Shield of South Carolina; Horizon Healthcare Services, Inc. (Horizon Blue Cross and Blue Shield of New Jersey); Blue Cross & Blue Shield of Rhode Island; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Vermont; Cambia Health Solutions, Inc.; Regence Blue Shield of Idaho; Regence Blue Cross Blue Shield of Utah; Regence Blue Shield (of Washington);*

Montgomery, AL 36104  
Tel: (334) 834-7600  
Fax: (334) 386-4381  
pslate@hillhillcarter.com

*With Cravath, Swaine & Moore LLP, counsel for Defendant Blue Cross Blue Shield of Alabama*

Jeffrey J. Zeiger, P.C.  
KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP  
300 North LaSalle  
Chicago, IL 60654  
Tel: (312) 862-2000  
Fax: (312) 862-2200  
jzeiger@kirkland.com

*Counsel for Defendants Health Care Service Corporation, an Illinois Mutual Legal Reserve Company, including its divisions Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Illinois, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Texas, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of New Mexico, Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Oklahoma, and Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Montana; Caring for Montanans, Inc., f/k/a Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Montana, Inc.; Highmark Health; Highmark Inc., f/k/a Highmark Health Services; Highmark West Virginia Inc.; Highmark BCBS Inc.; Highmark Western and Northeastern New York Inc. (except with respect to claims by Bed Bath and Beyond Inc. and its affiliates and discovery to Raytheon Technology Corporation and its affiliates and General Motors Company and its affiliates)*

*Regence Blue Cross Blue Shield of Oregon*

Gwendolyn Payton  
KILPATRICK TOWNSEND & STOCKTON  
LLP  
1420 Fifth Avenue, Suite 3700  
Seattle, WA 98101  
Tel: (206) 626-7714  
Fax: (206) 299-0414  
gpayton@kilpatricktownsend.com

*Counsel for Defendants Premera Blue Cross,  
d/b/a Premera Blue Cross Blue Shield of Alaska*

Brian K. Norman  
SHAMOUN & NORMAN, LLP  
1800 Valley View Lane, Suite 200  
Farmers Branch, TX 75234  
Tel: (214) 987-1745  
Fax: (214) 521-9033  
bkn@snlegal.com

H. James Koch  
ARMBRECHT JACKSON LLP  
RSA Tower, 27th Floor  
11 North Water Street  
Mobile, AL 36602  
Tel: (251) 405-1300  
Fax: (251) 432-6843  
hjk@ajlaw.com

*Counsel for Defendants CareFirst, Inc.; CareFirst  
of Maryland, Inc.; Group Hospitalization and  
Medical Services, Inc.; CareFirst BlueChoice, Inc.*

M. Patrick McDowell  
Norman E. "Benje" Bailey, Jr.  
BRUNINI, GRANTHAM, GROWER

Jonathan M. Redgrave  
REDGRAVE, LLP  
4800 Westfields Blvd, Suite 250  
Chantilly, VA 20151  
Tel: (703) 592-1155  
Fax: (612) 332-8915  
jredgrave@redgravellp.com

*Additional Counsel for HCSC and  
Highmark Defendants and California  
Physicians' Service d/b/a Blue Shield of  
California*

Todd M. Stenerson  
Brian C. Hauser  
SHEARMAN & STERLING LLP  
401 9th Street, N.W., Suite 800  
Washington, DC 20004  
Tel: (202) 508-8000  
Fax: (202) 508-8100  
todd.stenerson@shearman.com  
brian.hauser@shearman.com

Rachel Mossman Zieminski  
SHEARMAN & STERLING LLP  
2601 Olive Street, Suite 1700  
Dallas, TX 75201  
Tel: (214) 271-5777  
Fax: (214) 271-5778  
rachel.zieminski@shearman.com

Sarah L. Cylkowski  
Thomas J. Rheaume, Jr.  
BODMAN PLC  
1901 Saint Antoine Street  
6th Floor at Ford Field  
Detroit, MI 48226  
Tel: (313) 259-7777  
Fax: (734) 930-2494

& HEWES, PLLC  
190 East Capitol Street  
The Pinnacle Building, Suite 100  
Jackson, MS 39201  
Tel: (601) 948-3101  
Fax: (601) 960-6902  
pmcdowell@brunini.com

Cheri D. Green  
BLUE CROSS & BLUE SHIELD OF  
MISSISSIPPI, A MUTUAL INSURANCE  
COMPANY  
P.O. Box 1043  
Jackson, MS 39215  
Tel: (601) 932-3704  
cdgreen@bcbsms.com

*Counsel for Defendant Blue Cross & Blue Shield  
of Mississippi, a Mutual Insurance Company*

Alan D. Rutenberg  
FOLEY & LARDNER LLP  
3000 K Street, N.W., Suite 600  
Washington, DC 20007  
Tel: (202) 672-5491  
arutenberg@foley.com

Diane R. Hazel  
FOLEY & LARDNER LLP  
1400 16th Street, Suite 200  
Denver, CO 80202  
Tel: (720) 437-2034  
dhazel@foley.com

Ryan M. Hodinka  
BALCH & BINGHAM, LLP  
1901 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue North, Suite 1500  
Birmingham, AL 35203-4642  
Tel: (205) 226-3464  
Fax: (205) 488-5848  
rhodinka@balch.com

scylkowski@bodmanlaw.com  
trheaume@bodmanlaw.com

Andy P. Campbell  
A. Todd Campbell  
Yawanna N. McDonald  
CAMPBELL PARTNERS LLC  
505 North 20th Street, Suite 1600  
Birmingham, AL 35203  
Tel: (205) 224-0750  
Fax: (205) 224-8622  
andy@campbellpartnerslaw.com  
todd@campbellpartnerslaw.com  
yawanna@campbellpartnerslaw.com

*Counsel for Defendant Blue Cross and  
Blue Shield of Michigan*

John DeQ. Briggs  
Jeny M. Maier  
AXINN, VELTROP & HARKRIDER,  
LLP  
1901 L Street, N.W.  
Washington, DC 20036  
Tel: (202) 912-4700  
Fax: (202) 912-4701  
jbriggs@axinn.com  
jmaier@axinn.com

Kail J. Jethmalani  
AXINN, VELTROP & HARKRIDER,  
LLP  
114 W 47th Street  
New York, NY 10036  
Tel: (212) 728-2200  
Fax: (212) 728-2201  
kjethmalani@axinn.com

Stephen A. Rowe  
Aaron G. McLeod

*Counsel for Defendant USable Mutual Insurance Company, d/b/a Arkansas Blue Cross and Blue Shield and as Blue Advantage Administrators of Arkansas*

Robert K. Spotswood  
Michael T. Sansbury  
Joshua K. Payne  
Jess R. Nix  
Morgan B. Franz  
SPOTSWOOD SANSOM & SANSBURY LLC  
Financial Center  
505 20th Street North, Suite 700  
Birmingham, AL 35203  
Tel: (205) 986-3620  
Fax: (205) 986-3639  
rks@spotswoodllc.com  
msansbury@spotswoodllc.com  
jpayne@spotswoodllc.com  
jnix@spotswoodllc.com  
mfranz@spotswoodllc.com

*Counsel for Defendant Capital Blue Cross*

Robert R. Riley, Jr.  
RILEY & JACKSON, P.C.  
3530 Independence Drive  
Birmingham, AL 35209  
Tel: (205) 879-5000  
Fax: (205) 879-5901  
rob@rileyjacksonlaw.com

*Counsel for Defendants Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Florida, Inc.; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Massachusetts, Inc.; BlueCross BlueShield of Tennessee, Inc.*

ADAMS AND REESE LLP  
1901 Sixth Avenue North, Suite 3000  
Birmingham, AL 35203  
Tel: (205) 250-5080  
Fax: (205) 250-5034  
steve.rowe@arlaw.com  
aaron.mcleod@arlaw.com

*Counsel for Defendants Independence Hospital Indemnity Plan, Inc. f/k/a Independence Blue Cross; Independence Health Group, Inc.*

Kathleen Taylor Sooy  
Tracy A. Roman  
CROWELL & MORING LLP  
1001 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, DC 20004  
Tel: (202) 624-2500  
Fax: (202) 628-5116  
ksooy@crowell.com  
troman@crowell.com

Sarah Gilbert  
Honor Costello  
CROWELL & MORING LLP  
590 Madison Avenue, 20th Floor  
New York, NY 10022  
Tel: (212) 223-4000  
Fax: (212) 223-4134  
sgilbert@crowell.com  
hcostello@crowell.com

John M. Johnson  
Brian P. Kappel  
LIGHTFOOT FRANKLIN & WHITE  
LLC  
The Clark Building  
400 20th Street North

Edward S. Bloomberg  
John G. Schmidt Jr.  
Anna Mercado Clark  
PHILLIPS LYTLE LLP  
One Canalside  
125 Main Street  
Buffalo, NY 14203  
Tel: (716) 847-8400  
Fax: (716) 852-6100  
[ebloomberg@phillipslytle.com](mailto:ebloomberg@phillipslytle.com)  
[jschmidt@phillipslytle.com](mailto:jschmidt@phillipslytle.com)  
[aclark@phillipslytle.com](mailto:aclark@phillipslytle.com)

*Counsel for Defendants Excellus Health Plan, Inc., d/b/a Excellus BlueCross BlueShield and Lifetime Healthcare, Inc. (appearing for the MTA case only)*

Birmingham, AL 35203  
Tel: (205) 581-0700  
Fax: (205) 581-0799  
[jjohnson@lightfootlaw.com](mailto:jjohnson@lightfootlaw.com)  
[bkappel@lightfootlaw.com](mailto:bkappel@lightfootlaw.com)

*Counsel for Defendants Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Nebraska; GoodLife Partners, Inc.; Blue Cross of Idaho Health Service, Inc.; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Kansas, Inc.; Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Kansas City; HealthyDakota Mutual Holdings; Blue Cross Blue Shield of North Dakota; and Blue Cross Blue Shield of Wyoming*

SO ORDERED this \_\_\_\_ day of March, 2023.

---

**R. DAVID PROCTOR**  
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE